Comments and Responses on Public Review Draft of SOCCR/SAP 2.2 (September 2006)

COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC REVIEWERS						AUTHOR'S RESPONSE						
Comment Number	Reviewer ID	Chapter	Page	Line	Comment Text	Acknowledged, but no further reponse or revisions are required	Revisions have been incorporated as suggested in the comment	Agree, but see "Notes on Response"	Agree, but elaboration is precluded by length limitations	Disagree; see "Notes on Response"	Beyond scope of report/chapter	Notes on Response
06-001	12	6	6-1	14 ff	This chapter uses units of Mt CO2, whereas other chapters use units of Mt C. This inconsistency should be resolved.		X					Conversions added parenthetically
06-002	12	6	6-1	33-36	This summary of R&D priorities is surprisingly narrow. The emphasis on carbon capture and sequestration is welcome but is not reflected in that the report as a whole. Other technological options are discussed in this chapter and should be included among the key findings.			X				Carbon capture and sequestration are emphasized in this chapter, and emphasis is being added in Chapter 4. R&D priorities imply selectivity.
06-003	12	6	6-3	13	A report of this magnitude should attempt to resolve the described inconsistencies rather than simply reporting them. At the very least, the report should examine the reasons for inconsistencies in cross-country inventories, and present some assessment of their implications for carbon budget accounting.					X		SAPs are summaries of existing literature, not new analyses
06-004	12	6	6-4	10-14	This paragraph is apparently trying to say that some carbon sinks may be associated with bioenergy production. If so, this should be said more clearly, and more quantitative information should be provided.			X				Some words added. The main point is not the quantitative size of the sink.
06-005	12	6	6-4	17 ff	The predictive aspects of this section are not connected to or summarized in the more general chapters. The national projections are for annual emissions, not cumulative totals that are more critical for comparison to cumulative targets described in the next section on options (e.g. p. 6-7 lines 22-31).	X						Good point, but we report what we have.
06-006	8	6	6-6	24-26	Renewable energy sources (solar, wind, and hydroelectric) are viable sources of energy, but only in limited geographic areas and they will meet only a small percentage of the overall energy demand over the next 50 years. As a result, committing to specific sources of energy should be voluntary.	X						This chapter makes no judgments about choices; it simply describes categories of options.
06-007	3	6	6-7	6	This Page should highlight the overwhelming potential of improvements in energy efficiency to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Add the sentences "The United States uses nearly twice as much energy per person as Japan, the United Kingdom, and other countries that enjoy a high material standard of living (IEA 2005). The United States could significantly improve the efficiency of its energy use and reduce greenhouse gas emissions by up to half using existing technology without major sacrifices to the material standard of living." Reference: International Energy Agency (IEA). 2005. Key World Energy Statistics 2005. IEA, Paris, France.					X		This chapter is limited to discussing supply-side issues; efficiency improvement is covered in chapters 7-9.
06-008	3	6	6-7	13	This Page should highlight the overwhelming potential of renewable energy sources to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Add the sentence "In 2003, the world rate of energy use totaled 14 TW or 14 trillion watts. Nevertheless, available solar and wind power resources could potentially provide energy to the world at a rate of 70 TW (UNDP 2000)." Reference: United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). 2000. World Energy Assessment. UNDP, New York, NY.			X				We think the current text provides a balanced consideration of RE potentials.

COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC REVIEWERS						AUTHOR'S RESPONSE						
Comment Number	Reviewer ID	Chapter	Page	Line	Comment Text	Acknowledged, but no further reponse or revisions are required	Revisions have been incorporated as suggested in the comment	Agree, but see "Notes on Response"	Agree, but elaboration is precluded by length limitations	Disagree; see "Notes on Response"	Beyond scope of report/chapter	Notes on Response
06-009	3	6	6-8	10	Add the sentence "Twenty states and the District of Columbia have enacted policies that set a target for the fraction of electricity that utilities generate from renewable sources from 5% to 30% (REN21 2005)." Reference: REN21 Renewable Energy Policy Network. 2005. Renewables 2005 Global Status Report. Worldwatch Institute, Washington, DC.					X		True, but this summary is offered at a much more general level.
06-010	8	6	6-8	17-20	Investing across all business sectors does not employ the best use of capital in addressing the mitigation issue. Investments should be directed to projects with the best cost:benefit ratio. All investments in new facilities and technologies must meet certain financial requirements to ensure the economic sustainability of the company.	X						
06-011	8	6	6-10	25	Future greenhouse gas emissions and the evolution of their underlying driving forces are highly uncertain, so research priority should be given to exploring hypothesized interactions and linkages between key variables by using scenarios analysis, and how these might be affected by policy interventions.		X					
06-012	8	6	6-10	25	Global warming theory relies heavily on computer modeling of long-term climatology, and some models show adverse effects on climate while others do not; therefore, there needs to be global initiatives to systematically review the different global warming computer models to better understanding their ability to predict average temperatures over the long-term			X				Beyond the scope of this chapter.
06-013	8	6	6-11	9-11	Market and governmental incentives are essential before an industry can afford to invest in for GHG mitigation. Lower energy costs through use of process integration and co-generation is currently driving GHG mitigation, but more could be done by governments.	X						
06-014	12	6	6-14	Fig 1	This figure is vague, speculative, and of questionable illustrative value.					X		We think the figure usefully emphasizes generic points made in the text in words.